

Memo



Planning and Building Department

61 North Green Street
Brownsburg IN 46112
317.852.1128

To: Plan Commission

Cc: Tricia Leminger, Jon Blake, Dawn Brown

From: Todd A. Barker, AICP, Director of Planning & Building, Town of Brownsburg

Date: February 23, 2011

Re: PCCA-11-10-1056 West Wynne Farms PUD Commitment Amendment

Project Summary and Analysis:

This project (West Wynne Farms) was originally approved through the Hendricks County Area Plan Commission in 2007 as ZA-366/06 and later annexed into the Town via Ordinance 2008-25. To which the Town adopted for this project all of the development standards as approved in ZA-366/06 by Hendricks County.

Paul F. Rioux, of Platinum Properties, LLC. has petition the Town to amend two sections of the West Wynne Farms PUD development standards for "Parcel O" (2.05 A. 7. and 2.05 B.). As originally approved each sections reads as follows:

2.05 A. 7. Minimum Front Yard Setback: 10 feet from the R.O.W. of Subdivision streets

5.03 J. Design Standards
All operable windows on the front of the home shall have shutters.

5.03 N. Design Standards
The garage door on a two car garage shall be a maximum of forty (40%) percent of the lineal front façade when the garage door is even with or in front of the lineal front façade. The garage door on a three car garage shall be a maximum of fifty (50%) percent of the lineal front façade when the garage door is even with or in front of the front façade. Garages exceeding forty (40%) of the front façade must provide decorative windows in the garage door.

The petitioners proposed language reads as follows (the changed language is in red):

2.05 A. 7. Minimum Front Yard Setback: 25 feet from the R.O.W. on subdivision streets

5.03 J. Design Standards
All operable windows on the front of the home shall have shutters unless otherwise enhanced with six (6") inch wood trim detail or the windows are inset in brick, stone, or other masonry material.

5.03 N. Design Standards

The garage door on a two-car garage shall be a maximum of forty (40%) percent of the lineal front façade when the garage door is even with or in front of the lineal front façade. The garage door on a three-car garage shall be a maximum of fifty (50%) percent of the lineal front façade when the garage door is even with or in front of the front façade. Garages exceeding forty (40%) of the front façade must provide decorative windows in the garage door. Garage doors must be at or behind the front façade of the home. If garage doors exceed forty (40%) of the front façade decorative windows must be added.

REMOVE

2.05 B. Alley Access

Private alleyways, to be situated along the rear face of the proposed building, shall be utilized to access residences within "Parcel O". Said alleyways shall be privately maintained. Reference Section 10.02.A.11. for specifications. The travel lane shall be "one-way" and parking will not be permitted in alleys; Developer agrees to post restrictive signs.

10.02 K. Design Standards

Alleyways within "Parcel O" shall be constructed pursuant to the following:

1. Pavement shall be an inverted crown, measuring eighteen – twenty (18 – 20) feet in width.
2. Pavement section shall be 1" Asphalt Surface; placed upon 3" Asphalt Binder; placed upon 9" #53 Aggregate; placed upon prepared sub grade.
3. Minimum pavement cross slope shall be ¼ inch per foot.
4. Underdrain, with respect to size, material, and backfill, shall be placed below the pavement flow line in compliance with the specifications and standards of the governing jurisdiction at the time of platting.
5. Alleyways shall be placed within a "20 foot Ingress/Egress Easement or Public Right of Way".

Parcel "O" of West Wynne Farms has the following lot and building development standards:

1. Minimum Lot Area: 5,000 sq.ft.
2. Minimum Lot Width: 50 ft., measured at the building setback
3. Minimum Lot Frontage: 30 ft.
4. Maximum Lot Coverage: 50% - Accessory use 5% or 600 sq.ft. whichever is greater
5. Min. Ground Floor Living Area: 1,500 sq.ft., single-story - 900 sq.ft., multi-story (2,000 sq.ft total)
6. Maximum Height: 40 ft. principle structure – 18 ft. accessory structure
7. Min. Front Yard Setback: 10 feet from the R.O.W. of Subdivision streets
8. Min. Side Yard Setback: 0 ft.
9. Min. Rear Yard Setback: 10 ft.
10. Min. Dis. Between Princ. Blds: 10 ft.

The Parcel "O" development standards result in compact development commonly called walkable / traditional / pedestrian friendly neighborhoods. These types of residential standards in conjunction with pedestrian friendly commercial centers are elements of traditional neighborhood design.

Allowing garage access via the front of the residences verses an alley substantially changes several factors that make narrow lot alley loaded developments appealing in the context on a planned development like West Wynne Farms. The following are concerns that I have regarding this change:

- The change in streetscape going from alley loaded garages to front loaded garages;
- Architecture of homes dominated by garages doors;
- Off-street parking; (*min. 10' front setback does not allow for off-street parking if the garage is built to the front setback*)
- Building setback vs. Garage setback; (*in my opinion the min. 10' front setback should be a "build-to-line" for the residence, and the garage should have a min. 25' setback*)
- The PUD Site Development Plan shows that the primary north-south road through West Wynne Farms bisects Parcel "O", as a result of changing to front loaded garages the likelihood of more vehicles being parked along this roadway is greater, and there will now be vehicles backing out onto this primary roadway; and
- Road design on the primary north-south road;
 - Lane widths;
 - On-Street parking; and
 - Preservation of a walkable environment.

There are several design solutions for narrow lot front loaded developments that would reduce the dominance of the vehicles within the streetscape and that continue to encourage the walkable environment as West Wynne Farms was originally approved a few examples are as follows:

- Garage Off-Set: min. 10' behind the front façade;
- Garage wall area: max. 40% of the front façade;
- Covered Porches: min. 50%; of the front façade; and
- Tandem Garages: Where the second or third garage bay is behind instead of beside the other garage bay(s).

Recommendations:

I understand the market forces explained by Mr. Rioux which affects the demands for this style of housing within the overall concept of the West Wynne Farms project. However, the Town has issued five (5) building permits within the last year for alley loaded homes within Whittington Estates. This fact indicates to me that there is some market for alley loaded homes in Brownsburg combine that with discussions I have had with local experts that have developed "New Urbanism" style projects (*walkable / traditional / pedestrian friendly neighborhoods*) the execution of the development (*mix of product, amenities, lot sizes, architecture*) is as critical as the current market forces. It is my opinion that the execution of the development is just as critical in a fifty (50) foot front load project.

I also understand that there is a desire of the petitioner/developer to begin construction within this area of the project to foster the construction of Northfield Drive, all of which will benefit the Town. However, I am not able to support the conversion of this section of the West Wynne Farms project to a fifty (50) foot wide lots front load project. With the understanding that market forces have depressed most single family residential product types, I would like to recommend that the Planning Department continue to work with the petitioner to develop a solution that will fit well into the context of the West Wynne Farms project, that will result in high "quality" development, and that will be reasonably absorbed by the market.

Based on the evidence provided by the petitioners, the information in this report and the commitments list above I recommend that the Plan Commission **CONTINUE** this project.